Toxic Injury Prevention

E.I. DuPont de Nemours & Co. v. Castillo



James L. Ferraro

As Donna Castillo was taking one of her daily walks in November 1989 near Miami, Florida's Pine Island Farms tomato fields, farm workers sprayed her with the fungicide Benlate. She was about seven weeks pregnant.

Normally a baby's eyes develop during the first trimester of pregnancy, but when Castillo gave birth to her son John in June 1990, he had no eyes.

The newborn had sockets with small cysts where his eyes should have been.

Attorney James L. Ferraro of Ferraro & Associates in Miami, Florida filed a suit against DuPont, the manufacturer of Benlate, and Pine

Island Farms. He set an important precedent by convincing a jury that the pregnant woman's exposure to Benlate caused John Castillo to be born without eyes.

This is an extremely rare birth defect known as bilateral anopthalmia. It is the first case ever successfully prosecuted against a chemical company for causing a birth defect.

Ferraro endured three years of discovery, which included taking 63 depositions in four countries, reviewing tens of thousands of documents, and battling more than 60 pretrial motions. Ferraro also had the one onerous task of ruling out all other potential causes of the birth defect.

In addition, the trial included complex hearings on highly technical scientific issues that involved studies on rats and humans to determine the potential effects of Benlate exposure. It is the first case ever successfully prosecuted against a chemical company for causing a birth defect.

After a six-week trial, the Miami – Dade jury returned a \$4 million verdict against DuPont and Pine Island Farms

with half the amount for pain and suffering and the other half for future medical expenses.

The jury found that DuPont was 99.5 percent responsible and co-defendant Pine Island Farms was 0.5 percent responsible. This meant that DuPont's share of the damages was \$3.98 million.

So far, this is the only successful verdict on a claim that Benlate, often associated with widespread crop damage, can cause children to be born blind. The plaintiff's victory opened the courthouse doors to many children born without eyes due to DuPont's wrongful conduct. Ferraro has since filed 12 suits on behalf of other children in similar situations.

DuPont appealed the verdict to the Florida Supreme Court, which heard oral arguments on February 6, 2001, but has not yet ruled. On April 19, 2001, DuPont announced that it would stop selling Benlate. Attorney Ferraro states, "It is anticipated that this decision will govern science in the courtroom in Florida for the next 20 to 30 years."

[The later reported decision in this case is its subsequent case history can be found at E.I. Dupont de Nemours & Co. v. Castillo, 748 So. 2d 1108 (Fla. Dist. Ct. App. 2000) (reversing jury verdict), review granted (August 31, 2000).]

This is just one story of how America's civil justice system serves our communities and people like you. Fighting for Public Justice: Cases and Trial Lawyers That Made a Difference tells the facts behind the dramatic story of E.I. Dupont and de Nemours & Co. v. Castillo and many other public interest cases. This hardback book, published by Trial Lawyers for Public Justice and The TLPJ Foundation, includes a foreword by Erin Brockovich. To order copies, call 202-797-8600, or visit <u>www.flpj.org</u>